

Appendix 3 (as supplied by the authors): Study quality assessment

The Newcastle-Ottawa Scale used to grade the quality of each study (maximum=9 stars, higher is better) is as follows:

Author Country	Selection	Comparability	Outcome	Total
Gillum et al. 1991 ¹	***	**	***	*****
Gillman et al. 1993 ²	***	**	***	*****
Shaper et al. 1993 ³	***	**	*	*****
Wannamethee et al. 1993 ⁴	**	**	*	*****
Mensink et al. 1997 ⁵	**	**	***	*****
Benetos et al. 1999 ⁶	***	**	**	*****
Greenland et al. 1999 ⁷	****	**	***	*****
Palatini et al. 1999 ⁸	**	**	**	*****
Kristal-Boneh et al. 2000 ⁹	***	*	**	*****
Reunanen et al. 2000 ¹⁰	***	**	**	*****
Nilsson et al. 2001 ¹¹	****	**	***	*****
Seccareccia et al. 2001 ¹²	**	**	**	*****
Thomas et al. 2001 ¹³	***	**	**	*****
Kado et al. 2002 ¹⁴	**	**	**	*****
Palatini et al. 2002 ¹⁵	***	**	**	*****
Okamura et al. 2004 ¹⁶	****	**	**	*****
Jouven et al. 2005 ¹⁷	***	**	***	*****
Savonen et al. 2006 ¹⁸	***	**	***	*****
Stettler et al. 2007 ¹⁹	**	**	***	*****
Adabag et al. 2008 ²⁰	****	**	**	*****
Hansen et al. 2008 ²¹	**	**	*	*****
Hozawa et al. 2008 ²²	***	**	***	*****
Tverdal et al. 2008 ²³	****	**	**	*****
Hsia et al. 2009 ²⁴	****	**	*	*****
Poulter et al. 2009 ²⁵	****	**	**	*****
Mai et al. 2009 ²⁶	***	**	**	*****
Batty et al. 2010 ²⁷	*	**	**	*****
Cooney et al. 2010 ²⁸	****	**	**	*****
Mao et al. 2010 ²⁹	***	**	**	*****
Nauman et al. 2010 ³⁰	****	*	**	*****
Paul et al. 2010 ³¹	***	**	**	*****
Jouven et al. 2011 ³²	***	*	**	*****
Legeai et al. 2011 ³³	**	**	*	*****
Nauman et al. 2011 ³⁴	****	**	***	*****
Inoue et al. 2012 ³⁵	***	**	**	*****
Julius et al. 2012 ³⁶	***	**	**	*****
Courand et al. 2013 ³⁷	**	**	**	*****
Xu et al. 2013 ³⁸	***	**	**	*****
Aladin et al. 2014 ³⁹	***	**	**	*****

Appendix to: Zhang D, Wang W, Li F. Association between resting heart rate and coronary artery disease, stroke, sudden death and noncardiovascular diseases: a meta-analysis.

CMAJ 2016. DOI:10.1503/cmaj.160050. Copyright © 2016 The Author(s) or their employer(s).

To receive this resource in an accessible format, please contact us at cmajgroup@cmaj.ca.

Floyd et al. 2014 ⁴⁰	***	**	**	*****
Hisamatsu et al. 2014 ⁴¹	***	**	**	*****
Ho et al. 2014 ⁴²	***	**	**	*****
Wang et al. 2014 ⁴³	****	**	*	*****
Woodward et al. 2014 ⁴⁴	****	**	*	*****
O'Neal et al. 2015 ⁴⁵	***	**	*	*****

The scales allocate stars, maximum of nine, for quality of selection, comparability, exposure and outcome of study participants.

References

1. Gillum RF, Makuc DM, Feldman JJ. Pulse rate, coronary heart disease, and death: the NHANES I Epidemiologic Follow-up Study. *Am Heart J* 1991;121:172-177.
2. Gillman MW, Kannel WB, Belanger A, D'Agostino RB. Influence of heart rate on mortality among persons with hypertension: the Framingham Study. *Am Heart J* 1993;125:1148-1154.
3. Shaper AG, Wannamethee G, Macfarlane PW, Walker M. Heart rate, ischaemic heart disease, and sudden cardiac death in middle-aged British men. *Br Heart J* 1993;70:49-55.
4. Wannamethee G, Shaper AG, Macfarlane PW. Heart rate, physical activity, and mortality from cancer and other noncardiovascular diseases. *Am J Epidemiol* 1993;137:735-748.
5. Mensink GB, Hoffmeister H. The relationship between resting heart rate and all-cause, cardiovascular and cancer mortality. *Eur Heart J* 1997;18:1404-1410.
6. Benetos A, Rudnichi A, Thomas F, Safar M, Guize L. Influence of heart rate on mortality in a French population: role of age, gender, and blood pressure. *Hypertension* 1999;33:44-52.
7. Greenland P, Daviglius ML, Dyer AR, Liu K, Huang CF, Goldberger JJ, et al. Resting heart rate is a risk factor for cardiovascular and noncardiovascular mortality: the Chicago Heart Association Detection Project in Industry. *Am J Epidemiol* 1999;149:853-862.
8. Palatini P, Casiglia E, Julius S, Pessina AC. High heart rate: a risk factor for cardiovascular death in elderly men. *Arch Intern Med* 1999;159:585-592.
9. Kristal-Boneh E, Silber H, Harari G, Froom P. The association of resting heart rate with cardiovascular, cancer and all-cause mortality. Eight year follow-up of 3527 male Israeli employees (the CORDIS Study). *Eur Heart J* 2000;21:116-124.
10. Reunanen A, Karjalainen J, Ristola P, Heliovaara M, Knekt P, Aromaa A. Heart rate and mortality. *J Intern Med* 2000;247:231-239.
11. Nilsson PM, Nilsson JA, Hedblad B, Berglund G. Sleep disturbance in association with elevated pulse rate for prediction of mortality--consequences of mental strain? *J Intern Med* 2001;250:521-529.
12. Seccareccia F, Pannozzo F, Dima F, Minoprio A, Menditto A, Lo Noce C, et al. Heart rate as a predictor of mortality: the MATISS project. *Am J Public Health* 2001;91:1258-1263.
13. Thomas F, Guize L, Bean K, Benetos A. Pulse pressure and heart rate: independent risk factors for cancer? *J Clin Epidemiol* 2001;54:735-740.
14. Kado DM, Lui LY, Cummings SR. Rapid resting heart rate: a simple and powerful predictor of osteoporotic fractures and mortality in older women. *J Am Geriatr Soc* 2002;50:455-460.
15. Palatini P, Thijs L, Staessen JA, Fagard RH, Bulpitt CJ, Clement DL, et al. Predictive value of clinic and ambulatory heart rate for mortality in elderly subjects with systolic hypertension. *Arch Intern Med* 2002;162:2313-2321.
16. Okamura T, Hayakawa T, Kadowaki T, Kita Y, Okayama A, Elliott P, et al. Resting heart rate and cause-specific death in a 16.5-year cohort study of the Japanese general population. *Am Heart J* 2004;147:1024-1032.
17. Jouven X, Empana JP, Schwartz PJ, Desnos M, Courbon D, Ducimetiere P. Heart-rate profile during exercise as a predictor of sudden death. *N Engl J Med* 2005;352:1951-1958.
18. Savonen KP, Lakka TA, Laukkanen JA, Halonen PM, Rauramaa TH, Salonen JT, et al. Heart rate response during exercise test and cardiovascular mortality in middle-aged men. *Eur Heart J* 2006;27:582-588.
19. Stettler C, Bearth A, Allemann S, Zwahlen M, Zanchin L, Deplazes M, et al. QTc interval and resting heart rate as long-term predictors of mortality in type 1 and type 2 diabetes mellitus: a 23-year follow-up. *Diabetologia* 2007;50:186-194.
20. Adabag AS, Grandits GA, Prineas RJ, Crow RS, Bloomfield HE, Neaton JD. Relation of heart rate parameters during exercise test to sudden death and all-cause mortality in asymptomatic men. *Am J Cardiol* 2008;101:1437-1443.
21. Hansen TW, Thijs L, Boggia J, Li Y, Kikuya M, Bjorklund-Bodegard K, et al. Prognostic value of ambulatory heart rate revisited in 6928 subjects from 6 populations. *Hypertension* 2008;52:229-235.
22. Hozawa A, Inoue R, Ohkubo T, Kikuya M, Metoki H, Asayama K, et al. Predictive value of ambulatory heart rate in the Japanese general population: the Ohasama study. *J Hypertens* 2008;26:1571-1576.

-
23. Tverdal A, Hjellevik V, Selmer R. Heart rate and mortality from cardiovascular causes: a 12 year follow-up study of 379,843 men and women aged 40-45 years. *Eur Heart J* 2008;29:2772-2781.
 24. Hsia J, Larson JC, Ockene JK, Sarto GE, Allison MA, Hendrix SL, et al. Resting heart rate as a low tech predictor of coronary events in women: prospective cohort study. *BMJ* 2009;338:b219.
 25. Poulter NR, Dobson JE, Sever PS, Dahlof B, Wedel H, Campbell NR. Baseline heart rate, antihypertensive treatment, and prevention of cardiovascular outcomes in ASCOT (Anglo-Scandinavian Cardiac Outcomes Trial). *J Am Coll Cardiol* 2009;54:1154-1161.
 26. Mai JZ, Zhao LC, Liu XQ, Wu YF, Rao XX, Gao XM, et al. [Association between heart rate and all-cause death and coronary event in the Chinese cohort: 16 years follow up results]. *Zhonghua Xin Xue Guan Bing Za Zhi* 2009;37:750-753.
 27. Batty GD, Shipley MJ, Kivimaki M, Marmot M, Davey Smith G. Walking pace, leisure time physical activity, and resting heart rate in relation to disease-specific mortality in London: 40 years follow-up of the original Whitehall study. An update of our work with professor Jerry N. Morris (1910-2009). *Ann Epidemiol* 2010;20:661-669.
 28. Cooney MT, Vartiainen E, Laatikainen T, Juolevi A, Dudina A, Graham IM. Elevated resting heart rate is an independent risk factor for cardiovascular disease in healthy men and women. *Am Heart J* 2010;159:612-619 e613.
 29. Mao Q, Huang JF, Lu X, Wu X, Chen J, Cao J, et al. Heart rate influence on incidence of cardiovascular disease among adults in China. *Int J Epidemiol* 2010;39:1638-1646.
 30. Nauman J, Nilsen TI, Wisloff U, Vatten LJ. Combined effect of resting heart rate and physical activity on ischaemic heart disease: mortality follow-up in a population study (the HUNT study, Norway). *J Epidemiol Community Health* 2010;64:175-181.
 31. Paul L, Hastie CE, Li WS, Harrow C, Muir S, Connell JM, et al. Resting heart rate pattern during follow-up and mortality in hypertensive patients. *Hypertension* 2010;55:567-574.
 32. Jouven X, Escolano S, Celermaier D, Empana JP, Bingham A, Hermine O, et al. Heart rate and risk of cancer death in healthy men. *PLoS One* 2011;6:e21310.
 33. Legeai C, Jouven X, Tafflet M, Dartigues JF, Helmer C, Ritchie K, et al. Resting heart rate, mortality and future coronary heart disease in the elderly: the 3C Study. *Eur J Cardiovasc Prev Rehabil* 2011;18:488-497.
 34. Nauman J, Janszky I, Vatten LJ, Wisloff U. Temporal changes in resting heart rate and deaths from ischemic heart disease. *JAMA* 2011;306:2579-2587.
 35. Inoue R, Ohkubo T, Kikuya M, Metoki H, Asayama K, Kanno A, et al. Predictive value for mortality of the double product at rest obtained by home blood pressure measurement: the Ohasama study. *Am J Hypertens* 2012;25:568-575.
 36. Julius S, Palatini P, Kjeldsen SE, Zanchetti A, Weber MA, McInnes GT, et al. Usefulness of heart rate to predict cardiac events in treated patients with high-risk systemic hypertension. *Am J Cardiol* 2012;109:685-692.
 37. Courand PY, Milon H, Gustin MP, Froment A, Bricca G, Lantelme P. Effect modification of aortic atheroma on the prognostic value of heart rate in hypertension. *J Hypertens* 2013;31:484-491; discussion 491.
 38. Xu T, Bu X, Li H, Zhang M, Wang A, Tong W, et al. Smoking, heart rate, and ischemic stroke: a population-based prospective cohort study among Inner Mongolians in China. *Stroke* 2013;44:2457-2461.
 39. Aladin AI, Whelton SP, Al-Mallah MH, Blaha MJ, Keteyian SJ, Juraschek SP, et al. Relation of resting heart rate to risk for all-cause mortality by gender after considering exercise capacity (the Henry Ford exercise testing project). *Am J Cardiol* 2014;114:1701-1706.
 40. Floyd JS, Sitlani CM, Wiggins KL, Wallace E, Suchy-Dicey A, Abbasi SA, et al. Variation in resting heart rate over 4 years and the risks of myocardial infarction and death among older adults. *Heart* 2014.
 41. Hisamatsu T, Miura K, Ohkubo T, Yamamoto T, Fujiyoshi A, Miyagawa N, et al. High long-chain n-3 fatty acid intake attenuates the effect of high resting heart rate on cardiovascular mortality risk: a 24-year follow-up of Japanese general population. *J Cardiol* 2014;64:218-224.
 42. Ho JE, Larson MG, Ghorbani A, Cheng S, Coglianese EE, Vasan RS, et al. Long-term cardiovascular risks associated with an elevated heart rate: the Framingham Heart Study. *J Am Heart Assoc* 2014;3:e000668.
 43. Wang A, Chen S, Wang C, Zhou Y, Wu Y, Xing A, et al. Resting heart rate and risk of cardiovascular diseases and all-cause death: the kailuan study. *PLoS One* 2014;9:e110985.
 44. Woodward M, Webster R, Murakami Y, Barzi F, Lam TH, Fang X, et al. The association between resting heart rate, cardiovascular disease

-
- and mortality: evidence from 112,680 men and women in 12 cohorts. *Eur J Prev Cardiol* 2014;21:719-726.
45. O'Neal WT, Qureshi WT, Judd SE, Meschia JF, Howard VJ, Howard G, et al. Heart rate and ischemic stroke: the REasons for Geographic And Racial Differences in Stroke (REGARDS) study. *Int J Stroke* 2015.