

### Appendix 3. Additional tables

#### 1. CGs Characteristics

	Major Depression in Adults 2008		Obesity in Childhood and Adolescence 2009		Prostate Cancer Treatment 2008		Secondary Prevention of Stroke 2009		Total	
<b>Clinical questions, n</b>	14		25		26		22		87	
<b>Recommendations, n</b>	58		64		78		49		249	
<b>Topic</b>	Mental health		Metabolic disease		Cancer and palliative care		Cardiovascular disease			
<b>Search dates</b>										
. Start	01/02/2007		01/08/2008b		01/11/2007		01/09/2007			
<b>Publication date</b>	30/09/2008		15/12/2009		24/11/2008		22/04/2009			
<b>Strength of recommendations (SIGN system), n %</b>										
. A	8	13,8	1	1,6	13	16,7	14	28,6	36	14,5
. B	18	31,0	12	18,8	14	17,9	15	30,6	59	23,7
. C	4	6,9	7	10,9	3	3,8	5	10,2	19	7,6
. D	2	3,4	7	10,9	25	32,1	2	4,1	36	14,5
. Good Practice Point	26	44,8	37	57,8	23	29,5	13	26,5	99	39,8
<b>Clinical purpose, n %</b>										
. Prevention	0	0,0	56	87,5	0	0,0	49	100,0	105	42,2
. Screening	7	12,1	0	0,0	0	0,0	0	0,0	7	2,8
. Treatment	51	87,9	0	0,0	78	100,0	0	0,0	129	51,8
. Others	0	0,0	8	12,5	0	0,0	0	0,0	8	3,2

Appendix to: Martínez García L, Sanabria AJ, García Alvarez E, et al. The validity of recommendations from clinical guidelines: a survival analysis. *CMAJ* 2014.

DOI:10.1503/cmaj.140547.

Copyright © 2014 The Author(s) or their employer(s).

To receive this resource in an accessible format, please contact us at [cmajgroup@cmaj.ca](mailto:cmajgroup@cmaj.ca).



### 3. Update Search

	Major Depression in Adults 2008		Obesity in Childhood and Adolescence 2009		Prostate Cancer Treatment 2008		Secondary Prevention of Stroke 2009		Total	
<b>Clinical questions, n</b>	14		25		26		22		87	
<b>Recommendations, n</b>	58		64		78		49		249	
<b>Original search strategy, n</b>	1		0		1		1		3	
<b>Original information specialist, n</b>	0		0		0		1		1	
<b>Search dates</b>										
. Lower limit	01/01/2007		01/01/2008		01/01/2007		01/01/2007			
. [Start]	17/06/2011		28/11/2011		31/05/2011		28/06/2011			
. Upper limit [Finish]	26/10/2011		14/12/2011		31/07/2011		24/02/2012			
<b>Time search</b>										
. Lower - upper limit, years	4,8		3,9		4,5		5,1			
. Start - finish, months	4,3		0,5		2,0		7,9			
<b>References, n</b>	11243		9763		3343		14787		39136	

#### 4. First Screening

	Major Depression in Adults 2008		Obesity in Childhood and Adolescence 2009		Prostate Cancer Treatment 2008		Secondary Prevention of Stroke 2009		Total	
<b>Clinical questions, n</b>	14		25		26		22		87	
<b>Recommendations, n</b>	58		64		78		49		249	
<b>References, n</b>	11243		9763		3343		14787		39136	
<b>First references screening [pertinent], n %</b>										
. Duplicate	3846	34,2	2445	25,0	286	8,6	1582	10,7	8159	20,8
. Excluded	6976	62,0	6981	71,5	2901	86,8	12940	87,5	29798	76,1
. Included	260	2,3	334	3,4	102	3,1	255	1,7	951	2,4
. New references (1)	161	1,4	3	0,0	54	1,6	10	0,1	228	0,6
<b>References matching with recommendations, n %</b>										
. Recommendations without references	10	17,2	14	21,9	24	30,8	14	28,6	62	24,9
. Recommendations with references	48	82,8	50	78,1	54	69,2	35	71,4	187	75,1
<b>References/recomomendation, median (</b>	5	1_55	7	1_61	2	1_17	7	1_61		
<b>Recommendations turnover, n %</b>										
. Without references	10	17,2	14	21,9	24	30,8	14	28,6	62	24,9
. With low turnover (2)	26	44,8	25	39,1	28	35,9	18	36,7	97	39,0
. With high turnover (3)	22	37,9	25	39,1	26	33,3	17	34,7	90	36,1
(1) Studies may be related to new recommendations										
(2) ≤ median of references linked										
(3) > median of references linked										

## 5. Agreement Second Screening

	Major Depression in Adults 2008		Obesity in Childhood and Adolescence 2009		Prostate Cancer Treatment 2008		Secondary Prevention of Stroke 2009		Total	
Clinical questions, n	14		25		26		22		87	
Recommendations, n	58		64		78		49		249	
<b>Agreement 1 (relevant references)</b>										
. No	108	56,3	210	71,9	71	67,0	43	55,1	432	64,7
. Yes	84	43,8	82	28,1	35	33,0	35	44,9	236	35,3
Total	192		292		106		78		668	
Kappa	0,2	0.1_0.3	0,0	0.0_0.1	0,1	0.0_0.2	0,2	0.1_0.4		
<b>Agreement 2 (relevant references - post syntaxis)</b>										
. No	0		0		0		0	0,0	0	0,0
. Yes	192	100,0	292	100,0	106	100,0	78	100,0	668	100,0
Total	192		292		106		78		668	
<b>Agreement 3 (key references)</b>										
. No	37	31,1	55	27,6	16	19,0	37	56,1	145	31,0
. Yes	82	68,9	144	72,4	68	81,0	29	43,9	323	69,0
Total	119		199		84		66		468	
Kappa, range	0,1	0.0_0.2	0,2	0.1_0.3	0,2	(-)0.1_0.6	0,1	(-)0.1_0.3		
<b>Agreement 4 (key references - post syntaxis)</b>										
. No	34	28,6	52	26,1	16	19,0	35	53,0	137	29,3
. Yes	85	71,4	147	73,9	68	81,0	31	47,0	331	70,7
Total	119		199		84		66		468	

## 6. Recommendations survival results

Time	% of probability to still valid (95% CI)
<b>1 year</b>	92.0 (86.9 – 97.0)
<b>2 years</b>	85.7 (79.2 – 92.2)
<b>3 years</b>	81.3 (74.0 – 88.5)
<b>4 years</b>	77.8 (69.8 – 85.7)
Abbreviations: CI: coefficient interval.	

## 7. Resources Results

	Major Depression in Adults 2008			Obesity in Childhood and Adolescence 2009			Prostate Cancer Treatment 2008			Secondary Prevention of Stroke 2009			Total			
	Person, n	Ref, n	Time, hours	Person, n	Ref, n	Time, hours	Person, n	Ref, n	Time, hours	Person, n	Ref, n	Time, hours	Person, n	Ref, n	Time, hours	Ref/hour
<b>Baseline survey<sup>a</sup></b>																
. Expert clinicians	6	-	-	6	-	-	6	-	-	6	-	-	24	-	-	-
<b>Update exhaustive search</b>																
. Information specialist	1	-	180	1	-	30	1	-	51	1	-	18	4	-	279.0	-
<b>First screening – Pertinent references + References matched with recommendations</b>																
. Guideline methodologists	4	7608	142.4	5	7656	111.5	1	3217	160	6	13379	152.6	16	31860	566.5	70.4 (20.1-848.0)
<b>Feasibility Test<sup>a</sup></b>																
. Guideline methodologists	3	106	-	3	120	-	3	61	-	3	187	-	12	474	-	-
<b>Second screening – Relevant and key references<sup>b</sup></b>																
. Guideline methodologists	2	87	14.5	2	174	23.2	1	61	4.0	2	35	7.2	7	357	48.9	6.0 (4.0-15.3)
. Expert clinicians	6	192	93.0	4	292	67.2	6	112	69.3	5	78	47.0	21	674	276.5	4.8 (1.5-15.2)
Abbreviations: Ref: References.																
aTime not recorded.																
bReported n=17 (60.7%); Not reported n=9 (39.3%) impute 1 reference/10 minutes.																