

Appendix 3 (as supplied by the authors): Summary of meta-analyses of the effectiveness of pneumococcal polysaccharide vaccines (in order of publication year)

No.	Year	Author	Target group	Included RCTs	Outcomes (No. of studies)	Results (OR or RR <1 favours vaccine)	Vaccine type valency (No. of studies)
1	2008	Moberley ¹	Adults	Alfageme 2006 Örtqvist 1998 Koivula 1997 Davis 1987 Leech 1987 Klastersky 1986 Simberkoff 1986 Galliat 1985 Austrian 1980 Riley 1977 Smit 1977 Austrian 1976 Kaufman 1947	Invasive pneumococcal disease - all types (10) - vaccine types (5) Pneumonia, all cause (13) Definitive pneumococcal pneumonia - all types (10) - vaccine types (4) Presumptive pneumococcal pneumonia - all types (8) - vaccine types (5) Mortality - all cause (11) - due to pneumonia (7) - due to pneumococcal disease (3)	OR 0.26 (0.15-0.46) OR 0.18 (0.10-0.31) OR 0.71 (0.52-0.97) OR 0.26(0.15-0.46) OR 0.13(0.05-0.38) OR 0.47(0.23-0.99) OR 0.27 (0.08-0.87) OR 0.87(0.69-1.10) OR 0.75 (0.39-1.43) OR 2.51 (0.45-14.13)	2/3 (1), 12(1), 14(5), 17(1), 23(2) 2/3 (1), 13(1), 14(2), 23(1) 2/3(1), 6(1), 12(3), 13(1), 14(4), 17(1), 23(2) 2/3 (1), 12(1), 14(5), 17(1), 23(2) 2/3 (1), 12(1), 14(1), 23(1) 2/3 (1), 6(1), 12(1), 14(2), 17(1), 23(2) 2/3 (1), 6(1), 12(1), 14(1), 23(1) 2/3 (1), 12(2), 14(6), 17(1), 23(1) 2/3 (1), 12(2), 14(2), 17(1), 23(1) 14(2), 17(1)
			Conclusions summarized in abstract	This meta-analysis provides evidence supporting the recommendation for PPV to prevent IPD in adults. The evidence from RCTs is less clear with respect to adults with chronic illness. This might be because of lack of effect or lack of power in the studies. The metaanalysis does not provide compelling evidence to support the routine use of PPV to prevent all-cause pneumonia or mortality.			
2	2007	Chang ²	Children and adults with bronchiectasis	None (3 excluded)	Reduction of the severity and frequency of respiratory exacerbations and pulmonary decline	-	-
			Conclusions summarized in abstract	At present, there is a lack of reliable evidence to support or refute the routine use of pneumococcal vaccine as routine management in children and adults with bronchiectasis. Randomised controlled trials examining the efficacy of this intervention using various vaccine types in different age groups are needed. Until further evidence is available, it is recommended that health providers adhere to national guidelines.			

continued

Ref.	Year	Author	Target group	Included RCTs	Outcomes (No. of studies)	Results (OR or RR <1 favours vaccine)	Vaccine type valency (No. of studies)
3	2006	Granger ³	COPD patients	Alfageme 2006 Steentoft 2006 Davis 1987 Leech 1987	Acute exacerbations (1) Pneumonia (3) - all - 23 valent - 14 valent Emergency department visits (1) pneumonia LRTI URTI Mortality, cardiorespiratory (3) - all - 23 valent - 14 valent	OR 1.43 (0.31-6.69) OR 0.89 (0.58-1.37) OR 0.97 (0.61-1.53) OR 0.42 (0.10-1.72) RR 0.99 (0.52-1.88) RR 1.00 (0.75-1.33) RR 1.29 (0.68-2.47) OR 1.07 (0.69-1.66) OR 1.11 (0.66-1.88) OR 0.98 (0.44-2.18)	23 23(2), 14(1) 14 (1) 14 (1) 14 (1) 23(1), 14(2)
			Conclusions summarized in abstract	There is no evidence from randomised controlled trials that injectable pneumococcal vaccination in persons with COPD has a significant impact on morbidity or mortality. Further large randomised controlled trials would be needed to ascertain if the small benefits suggested by individual studies are real.			
4	2005	Chaithong-wongwatt-hana ⁴	Pregnant women (to prevent infant infection)	Munoz 2001 O'Dempsey 1996 Shahid 1995	Neonatal infections - pneumonia (1) - meningitis (1) - otitis media (1) - all infection (1)	RR 0.58 (0.18-1.90) RR 3.04 (0.13-73.44) RR 0.14 (0.01-2.75) RR 0.51 (0.18-1.41)	23(1) 23(1) 23(1) 23(1)
			Conclusions summarized in abstract	There is insufficient evidence to support whether pneumococcal vaccination during pregnancy could reduce infant infections.			
5	2004	Melegaro ⁵	Elderly: low risk groups (LRG) and high risk groups (HRG)	Honkanen 1999 Örtqvist 1998 Koivula 1997 Davis 1987 Leech 1987 Simberkoff 1986 Klustersky 1986 Gaillat 1985	Pneumococcal pneumonia - LRG (3) - HRG (4) Invasive pneumococcal disease - LRG (2) - HRG (4)	OR 0.84 (0.47-1.50) OR 1.20 (0.75-1.92) OR 0.35 (0.08-1.49) OR 0.80 (0.80-2.88)	14(2),23(1) 14(2),17(1), 23(1) 14(1),23(1) 14(2),17(1), 23(1)
			Conclusions summarized in abstract (abbrev.)	When taken with the results of other metaanalyses and observational studies, it appears that PPV offers protection against IPD in the general elderly population whereas it has a moderate effect in the high-risk elderly. The vaccine has little or no effect against pneumonia.			

continued

Ref.	Year	Author	Target group	Included RCTs	Outcomes (No. of studies)	Results (OR or RR <1 favours vaccine)	Vaccine type valency (No. of studies)
6	2004	Conaty ⁶	Adults	French 2000 Honkanen 1999 Örtqvist 1998 Koivula 1997 Davis 1987 Leech 1987 Simberkoff 1986 Klatersky 1986 Gaillat 1985 Austrian 1980 Riley 1977 Smit 1977	Invasive pneumococcal disease - all RCTs (9) - elderly/chronic disease (7) All-cause pneumonia - all RCTs (13) - develop. (high incidence) (3) - elderly/chronic disease (9)	OR 0.62 (0.37-1.04) OR 0.51 (0.21-1.23) *R ² 0.97 (0.81-1.16) *R ² 0.66 (0.57-0.77) *R ² 1.03 (0.86-1.25)	14(5), 17(1), 23(3) 14(4), 17(1), 23(2) 6(1), 12(3), 14(6), 23(3) 6(1), 12(1) 14(1) 12F(2), 14(5), 23(2)
			Conclusions summarized in abstract	From 13 observational studies the estimate of vaccine efficacy against invasive disease was 53% (46%–59%) compared with 38% (–4% to 63%) from nine RCTs. Estimates of protection against all-cause pneumonia were based on fewer, heterogeneous studies that were not consistent with the findings from RCTs for this outcome. From five studies combined efficacy was 32% (7%–50%) compared with 3% (–16% to 19%) from 13 RCTs.			
7	2004	Davies ⁷	Sickle cell patients	Goldblatt 2000 John 1985 Rigau-Pirez 1983 Vernacchio 1998	Definitive pneumococcal infection (1)	OR 3.01(0.65-13.91)	14(1)
			Conclusions summarized in abstract (abbrev.)	Only one trial reported incidence of pneumococcal infection, and this demonstrated that the polysaccharide pneumococcal vaccine used (PPV14) failed to reduce significantly the risk of infection in children under three years of age, but was associated with only minor adverse events. (...)We therefore recommend that conjugate pneumococcal vaccines are used in people with sickle cell disease.			
8	2003	Straetemans ⁸	Children, focus on AOM, PPV and PCV examined, only PPV reported here	Douglas 1986 Karma 1985 Douglas 1984 Schuller 1983 Makela 1981 Sloyer 1981 Teele 1981	Proportion children with AOM - all ages (7) - aged up to 24 months (4) - older than 24 months (2) - 6–54 months (1) AOM episodes per person month - vaccine type (3) - all types, <24m (7) - all types, >24m (5) - all types(12) AOM episodes per person month in children with previous AOM - <24 months (3) - >24 months (3) - all ages (6)	RR 0.94 (0.86-1.03) RR 0.98 (0.87-1.11) RR 0.84 (0.65-1.09) RR 0.90 (0.77-1.06) RR 0.72 (0.43-1.21) RR 0.93 (0.84-1.04) RR 0.77(0.67-0.89) RR 0.88(0.79-0.97) RR 0.80 (0.69-0.93) RR 0.85 (0.71-1.02) RR 0.74 (0.59-0.93)	8(2), 14(2) 14 14 8(1), 14(2) 8(2), 14(5) 14(5) 8(2),14(10) 8(2), 14(1) 14 (3) 8(2), 14(4)
			Conclusions summarized in abstract (abbrev.)	Based on the currently available results of the effectiveness of pneumococcal vaccination for the prevention of AOM, a large scale use of pneumococcal polysaccharide and conjugate vaccination for this specific indication is not yet recommended.			

continued

Ref.	Year	Author	Target group	Included RCTs	Outcomes (No. of studies)	Results (OR or RR <1 favours vaccine)	Vaccine type valency (No. of studies)
9	2003	Dear ⁹	Adults, includes observational studies	Honkanen 1999 Örtqvist 1998 Koivula 1997 Davis 1987 Leech 1987 Klastersky 1986 Simberkoff 1986 Galliat 1985 Austrian 1980 Riley 1977 Smit 1977 Austrian 1976 Kaufman 1947	Definitive pneumococcal pneumonia - all (8) - vaccine types only (4) Pneumonia, all cause (14) Pneumonia, presumptive pneumococcal - all((7) - vaccine types only (5) Mortality - all cause (11) - pneumonia (8) - pneumococcal infection(2)	OR 0.28 (0.15-0.52) OR 0.18 (0.05-0.58) OR 0.77(0.58-1.02) OR 0.52 (0.31-0.87) 0.23 (0.14-0.36) OR 0.90(0.76-1.07) OR 0.72(0.44-1.19) OR 1.47 (0.18-12.37)	2/3(1), 14(5), 17(1), 23(1) 2/3(1), 12(1), 14(1), 23(1) 2/3(1), 6(1), 12(3), 13(1), 14(5), 17(1), 23(2) 2/3(1), 6(1), 12(1), 14(2), 17(1), 23(1) 2/3(1), 6(1), 12(1), 14(1), 23(1) 2/3(1), 12(2) 14(5), 17(1), 23(2) 2/3(1), 12(2), 14(4), 23(1) 12(1), 14(1)
			Conclusions summarized in abstract (abbrev.)	While polysaccharide pneumococcal vaccines do not appear to reduce the incidence of pneumonia or death in adults with or without chronic illness, or in the elderly (55 years and above), the evidence from non-randomised studies suggests that the vaccines are effective in reducing the incidence of the more specific outcome, invasive pneumococcal disease, among adults and the immunocompetent elderly (55 years and above).			
10	2002	Puig-Barbera ¹⁰	Elderly	Honkanen 1999 Örtqvist 1998 Davis 1987 Simberkoff 1986 Galliat 1985 Bently 1981 Austrian 1980 Kaufman 1947	Pneumococcal pneumonia (3) Invasive pneumococcal disease	RR 1.15(0.66-1.99) Includes non-RCTs	14(2), 23(1)
			Conclusions summarized in abstract	No evidence was found supporting pneumococcal vaccine effectiveness to reduce or avoid S. pneumoniae disease in the elderly.			

continued

Ref.	Year	Author	Target group	Included RCTs	Outcomes (No. of studies)	Results (OR or RR <1 favours vaccine)	Vaccine type valency (No. of studies)
11	2002	Watson ¹¹	Adults	Honkanen 1999 Örtqvist 1998 Koivula 1997 Davis 1987 Leech 1987 Klastersky 1986 Simberkoff 1986 Galliat 1985 Austrian 1980 Riley 1977 Smit 1977 Austrian 1976	Pneumococcal pneumonia - industrialised (5) - less industrialised (0) - high risk (2) - elderly (2) Pneumonia, all cause - industrialised (9) - less industrialised (3) - high risk (3) - elderly (2) Bacteraemia - industrialised (6) - less industrialised (1) - high risk (1) - elderly (1) Mortality -Industrialised (8) -less industrialised (1) -high risk (3) -elderly (1)	RR 1.06 (0.82-1.38) - RR 0.91 (0.33-2.53) RR 1.01 (0.69-1.49) RR 1.03 (0.86-1.25) RR 0.67 (0.52-0.87) RR 1.13 (0.79-1.62) RR 1.15 (0.95-1.40) RR 0.53 (0.20-1.43) RR 0.14 (0.02-1.14) RR 0.81 (0.05-12.16) RR 0.37 (0.07-1.91) RR 1.07 (0.97-1.18) RR 0.79 (0.63-0.99) RR 1.15 (0.87-1.52) RR 0.99 (0.80-1.22)	Unclear which study in which analyses
			Conclusions summarized in abstract	Benefit from pneumococcal vaccination depends on the baseline risk of infection and characteristics of a given population. Evidence from randomised trials for widespread adult vaccination in industrial countries is lacking.			
12	2001	Cornu ¹²	Immunocompetent adults	Örtqvist 1998 Koivula 1997 Davis 1987 Leech 1987 Klastersky 1986 Simberkoff 1986 Galliat 1985 Austrian 1980 Riley 1977 Smit 1977 Austrian 1976	Definitive pneumococcal pneumonia (6) Presumptive pneumococcal pneumonia (8) Pneumonia, all cause (11) Mortality - all cause (9) - pneumonia (8)	OR 0.29(0.20-0.42) OR 0.60 (0.37-0.96) OR 0.80 (0.59-1.08) OR 1.01 (0.91-1.12) OR 0.69 (0.51-0.93)	13(1), 14(3), 17(1), 23(1) 6(1), 12(3), 13(1), 14(1), 17(1), 23(1) 6(1)12(2), 13(1), 14(6), 23(1) 12(2), 14(6), 23(1) 12(2), 14(4), 17(1), 23(1)
			Conclusions summarized in abstract	In the fourteen trials totalling 48,837 patients retrieved, PPV prevents definite pneumococcal pneumonia by 71%, presumptive pneumococcal pneumonia by 40%, and mortality due to pneumonia by 32%, but not all-cause pneumonia or death. No preventive effect was seen in the subgroup of patients aged 55 years or more, possibly due to a lack of statistical power.			

continued

Ref.	Year	Author	Target group	Included RCTs	Outcomes (No. of studies)	Results (OR or RR <1 favours vaccine)	Vaccine type valency (No. of studies)
13	2001	Sheikh ¹³	Asthma	Schuller 1983	Excluded due to low quality (poor allocation concealment)	-	
			Conclusions summarized in abstract	This review found very limited evidence to support the routine use of pneumococcal vaccine in people with asthma. A randomised trial of vaccine efficacy in children and adults with asthma is needed.			
14	2000	Moore ¹⁴	All	French 2000 Örtqvist 1998 Koivula 1997 Davis 1987 Leech 1987 Klustersky 1986 Simberkoff 1986 Galliat 1985 Austrian 1980 Riley 1977 Smit 1977 Austrian 1976	Pneumococcal pneumonia - healthy, immunocomp. (3) - elderly, high risk (7) Pneumonia, all cause - healthy, immunocomp. (3) - elderly, high risk (5) Lower respiratory tract infection - healthy, immunocomp. (2) - elderly, high risk (3) Mortality, pneumonia - healthy, immunocomp. (1) - elderly, high risk (8) Pneumococcal bacteraemia - healthy, immunocomp. (1) - elderly, high risk (3)	RR 0.16 (0.11-0.23) RR 0.88 (0.72-1.07) RR 0.56 (0.47-0.66) RR 1.08 (0.92-1.27) RR 0.85 (0.71-1.02) RR 1.06 (0.97-1.16) RR 0.70 (0.50-0.96) RR 0.93 (0.72-1.20) RR 0.18 (0.009-0.34) RR 0.53 (0.14-1.94)	Unclear which study in which analyses
			Conclusions summarized in abstract	Present guidelines recommend pneumococcal vaccination for "high-risk" groups. There is no evidence from randomised trials that this is of any benefit.			
15	1999	Hutchison ¹⁵	Adults	Davis 1987 Leech 1987 Klustersky 1986 Simberkoff 1986 Galliat 1985 Austrian 1980 Riley 1977 Smit 1977 Austrian 1976 Kaufman 1947 MacLeod 1945	Pneumococcal pneumonia - all types (7) - vaccine types (9) Systemic pneumococcal infection - all types (6) - vaccine types (4)	OR 0.58 (0.47-0.72) OR 0.25 (0.20-0.33) OR 0.27 (0.13-0.49) OR 0.17 (0.09-0.31)	2/3(1), 4(1) 12(1), 14(3), 17(1) 2/3(1),4(1),6(2),12(2), 13(1) 14(2) 2/3(1),14(4),17(1) 2/3(1),6(1),13(1) 14(1)
			Conclusions summarized in abstract	Vaccination with pneumococcal polysaccharide vaccine can be expected to reduce the risk of systemic infection due to pneumococcal types included in the vaccine by 83% and systemic infection due to all pneumococci by 73%. We found no evidence that the vaccine was less efficacious for the elderly, institutionalized people, or those with chronic illness.			

continued

Ref.	Year	Author	Target group	Included RCTs	Outcomes (No. of studies)	Results (OR or RR <1 favours vaccine)	Vaccine type valency (No. of studies)
16	1996	Go	Normal subjects, antibody response only				
			Conclusions summarized in abstract	Response to pneumococcal vaccine among normal subjects varies widely. Better designed and prospective studies are needed to define the parameters of a normal antibody response to pneumococcal vaccine so that uniform guidelines of interpretation can be formulated.			
17	1994	Fine ¹⁶	Adults	Davis 1987 Leech 1987 Klustersky 1986 Simberkoff 1986 Galliat 1985 Austrian 1980 Riley 1977 Smit 1977 Austrian 1976	Definitive pneumococcal pneumonia - all types - vaccine types	OR 0.34 (0.24-0.48) OR 0.17 (0.09-0.33)	Unclear which study in which analyses
					Presumptive pneumococcal pneumonia - all types - vaccine types	OR 0.47 (0.35-0.63) OR 0.39 (0.26-0.59)	
					Pneumonia, all cause	OR 0.90 (0.77-1.04)	
					Bronchitis	OR 0.84 (0.69-1.02)	
					Mortality - all cause - pneumonia - pneumococcal	OR 1.02 (0.9-1.14) OR 0.78 (0.57-1.06) OR 4.59 (0.54-38.81)	
			Conclusions summarized in abstract	Pneumococcal vaccination appears efficacious in reducing bacteremic pneumococcal pneumonia in low risk adults. However, evidence from randomized controlled trials fails to demonstrate vaccine efficacy for pneumococcal infection-related or other medical outcomes in the heterogeneous group of subjects currently labeled as high risk.			

RR = relative risk; OR = odds ratio; COPD = chronic obstructive pulmonary disease; NR = not reported; n/a = not applicable; LRTI = lower respiratory tract infection; URTI = upper respiratory tract infection; IPD = invasive pneumococcal disease; RCT = randomized controlled trial; AOM = acute otitis media; PPV / PPV14 = polysaccharide pneumococcal vaccine / 14-valent pneumococcal polysaccharide vaccine.

*Meaning unclear (reported as R² in tables, without explanation in text);

References

1. Moberley SA, Holden J, Tatham DP, et al. Vaccines for preventing pneumococcal infection in adults. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2008; (1):CD000422.
2. Chang CC, Singleton RJ, Morris PS, et al. Pneumococcal vaccines for children and adults with bronchiectasis. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2007; (2):CD006316.
3. Granger R, Walters J, Poole PJ, et al. Injectable vaccines for preventing pneumococcal infection in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2006; (4):CD001390.
4. Chaithongwongwatthana S, Yamasmit W, Limpongsanurak S, et al. Pneumococcal vaccination during pregnancy for preventing infant infection. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2006; (1):CD004903.
5. Melegaro A, Edmunds WJ. The 23-valent pneumococcal polysaccharide vaccine. Part II. A cost-effectiveness analysis for invasive disease in the elderly in England and Wales. *Eur J Epidemiol* 2004;19:365-75.
6. Conaty S, Watson L, Dinnes J, et al. The effectiveness of pneumococcal polysaccharide vaccines in adults: a systematic review of observational studies and comparison with results from randomised controlled trials. *Vaccine* 2004;22:3214-24.

7. Davies EG, Riddington C, Lottenberg R, et al. Pneumococcal vaccines for sickle cell disease. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2004; (1):CD003885.
8. Straetemans M, Sanders EA, Veenhoven RH, et al. Pneumococcal vaccines for preventing otitis media. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2004; (1):CD001480.
9. Dear K, Holden J, Andrews R, et al. Vaccines for preventing pneumococcal infection in adults. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2003; (4):CD000422.
10. Puig-Barbera J, Belenguier Varea A, Goterris Pinto M, et al. [Pneumococcal vaccine effectiveness in the elderly. Systematic review and meta-analysis] [Article in Spanish]. *Aten Primaria* 2002;30:269-81; discussion 281-3.
11. Watson L, Wilson BJ, Waugh N. Pneumococcal polysaccharide vaccine: a systematic review of clinical effectiveness in adults. *Vaccine* 2002;20:2166-73.
12. Cornu C, Yzebe D, Leophonte P, et al. Efficacy of pneumococcal polysaccharide vaccine in immunocompetent adults: a meta-analysis of randomized trials. *Vaccine* 2001;19:4780-90.
13. Sheikh A, Alves B, Dhimi S. Pneumococcal vaccine for asthma. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2002; (1):CD002165.
14. Moore RA, Wiffen PJ, Lipsky BA. Are the pneumococcal polysaccharide vaccines effective? Meta-analysis of the prospective trials. *BMC Fam Pract* 2000;1:1. Epub 2000 Oct 4.
15. Hutchison BG, Oxman AD, Shannon HS, et al. Clinical effectiveness of pneumococcal vaccine. Meta-analysis. *Can Fam Physician* 1999;45:2381-93.
16. Fine MJ, Smith MA, Carson CA, et al. Efficacy of pneumococcal vaccination in adults. A meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. *Arch Intern Med* 1994;154:2666-77.